

Bailey, T. Melville; Filer, Patricia; Fraser, Robert L.; and Weaver, John C, eds. *Dictionary of Hamilton Biography*. Volume I. Hamilton: Dictionary of Hamilton Biography, 1981. Pp. xii, 244. Maps, illustrations

Douglas McCalla

Volume 12, numéro 1, june 1983

URI : <https://id.erudit.org/iderudit/1019001ar>

DOI : <https://doi.org/10.7202/1019001ar>

[Aller au sommaire du numéro](#)

Éditeur(s)

Urban History Review / Revue d'histoire urbaine

ISSN

0703-0428 (imprimé)

1918-5138 (numérique)

[Découvrir la revue](#)

Citer ce compte rendu

McCalla, D. (1983). Compte rendu de [Bailey, T. Melville; Filer, Patricia; Fraser, Robert L.; and Weaver, John C, eds. *Dictionary of Hamilton Biography*. Volume I. Hamilton: Dictionary of Hamilton Biography, 1981. Pp. xii, 244. Maps, illustrations]. *Urban History Review / Revue d'histoire urbaine*, 12(1), 84–86. <https://doi.org/10.7202/1019001ar>

Hamilton is a most attractively produced volume. Its photographs are superb in range and clarity of reproduction — the view of the Mt. Hamilton Incline Railway on the front of the jacket is particularly striking. Writing a good city biography is a difficult task, and Professor Weaver has succeeded with a study which should please both the academic and general reader.

Elizabeth Bloomfield
Guelph, Ontario

Bailey, T. Melville; Filer, Patricia; Fraser, Robert L.; and Weaver, John C., eds. *Dictionary of Hamilton Biography*. Volume I. Hamilton: Dictionary of Hamilton Biography, 1981. Pp. xii, 244. Maps, illustrations.

Hamilton has long possessed an able and active community of local historians who have given the city's history shape and significance by defining locally important individuals and events and providing a chronology of the city's development and emerging character. The Hamilton Public Library maintains a very impressive set of local historical and biographical reference files, and students of the city's history are blessed with two excellent modern local histories, C.M. Johnston's *The Head of the Lake* (1958) and Marjorie Freeman Campbell's *A Mountain and A City* (1966). The *Dictionary of Hamilton Biography* emerges from this tradition and has its origins in a dictionary projected by one of the doyens of local history, T. Melville Bailey (editor-in-chief of the present volume). Much of the research was done by a team of researchers under a 1978 Young Canada Works grant. To this have been added several editorial stages (overseen by a board consisting of Bailey, Patricia Filer, Robert Fraser, and John Weaver), some thirty-five articles specially commissioned for the volume from specialists (notably the board members themselves), and Ontario Heritage Foundation advice and money. The influence and model of the *Dictionary of Canadian Biography* were clearly in mind, and the cooperation of the *D.C.B.* and several of its current and former staff members is fully acknowledged. The present volume is meant to cover individuals whose major role in Hamilton came prior to 1875. Another volume is envisaged to carry the story to 1940, and a third is anticipated to bring the story up to date.

It hardly needs to be said that there are both distinctions and links between the fields of local history and urban history. The essential focus of the former is the character of some particular community, as defined through time. More commonly the domain of the enthusiastic amateur, it has often been eclectic, romantic, and antiquarian, delighting in local legend and anecdote, and frequently over-inclined to stress the uniqueness and special importance of the locality under study. There is, often, a curiously repetitive quality to the books and arti-

cles that make up the corpus of works on a community's local history, each new work being more inclined to retell the old stories than to go back to the original primary sources to rethink the history from the beginning. Urban history, by contrast, has been a product chiefly of professional scholars. Though frequently drawing on the literature produced by local historians, it is more aware of wider and more structural forces, more inclined to ask comparative questions and to see the external context in which a local story is placed, and more likely to look for the typical than the unusual. While the present volume has certainly had the latter concerns in mind and has avoided most of the pitfalls of its genre, it nevertheless remains, in basic conception, local history; as a result, just how it may serve the urban historian needs to be considered.

As the introductory material makes clear, the basis for inclusion in the *D.H.B.* was to have lived at least briefly in the area, to have done something sufficiently notable while there to be remembered, and to have left behind locally accessible documentation. The volume has a commendably broad focus and attempts to cover "Indians, soldiers, explorers, pioneers, clergymen, musicians, criminals, medical people, lawyers, engineers, architects, mayors, newspapermen, bankers, railway builders, shopkeepers, legislators, artists, inventors, authors, actors, educators, and businessmen who shaped the city and region we have today" (p. x). Of these, clergy, physicians, the press, politics, and local business seem best served. In all cases, an attempt has been made to cover the individual's whole career, not just its Hamilton dimensions. In keeping with local tradition, Sir Allan MacNab (ten pages) and Isaac Buchanan (six pages) are given greatest emphasis — it is difficult to quarrel with the former, but the latter emphasis might be questioned. Of the 331 people included, at least thirty-five (including, obviously, many of those best known outside Hamilton) are also covered by already published volumes of the *D.C.B.*, more often than not at greater length in the latter. Some articles are by the same authors in both sources, while others are by equally well qualified professional scholars. In still other cases (e.g., C.J. Brydges, John Rae), the *D.C.B.* offers clearly superior treatment, even for specifically Hamilton material. Surprisingly, at least twenty-five articles cover figures who clearly flourished and were most important in a Hamilton context after 1875. Among these are the two worthies pictured on the book's dust jacket, Alexander W. Aitchison, fire-chief from 1870 to 1905, and Sir John Gibson, whose long political career, culminating in the Lieutenant-Governorship of Ontario, came entirely after 1875.

Some articles on important local figures are disappointingly short (e.g., those on Robert Smiley, founder of the *Hamilton Spectator*, and Andrew Steven, cashier of Hamilton's key financial institution, the Gore Bank,

from 1836 to 1861). Other figures are omitted altogether. R.W. Harris, for example, president of Hamilton's Great Western Railroad throughout the main years of its construction, is not here (though he is in the *D.C.B.*); nor is James Osborne, a leading mid-century merchant who figures prominently in Michael Katz's account of Hamilton's entrepreneurs. There is a handsome picture of Archibald MacNab in the abundant and attractive illustrations, but only a single sentence on him anywhere in the text. Such exclusions could hardly be avoided, but as they emphasize, the volume is selective and somewhat eclectic rather than comprehensive in its coverage of any single group among those selected for inclusion.

That this volume will be of real value to students of Hamilton's history, who are the avowed audience for it, goes almost without saying. For those without so particular an interest, John Weaver's sound if brief introduction will help to find articles of specific relevance. The major articles (identified by credits at the end), at least if by different authors from the *D.C.B.* (e.g., Allan MacNab, Isaac Buchanan), are valuable as second opinions. Among the signed articles, those by Robert Fraser deserve particular mention; more than any of the others they open unexplored dimensions of Hamilton's past (see, for e.g., the articles on Abraham Markle and Jacob Overholser, two local citizens who wound up on the wrong side of the War of 1812, and Mary Osborne and Michael Vincent, both of whom died on the gallows). Because many of the individuals included passed only portions of their careers in Hamilton, their names and lives will come to the attention of the historians of other communities, who may also benefit from some of the *D.H.B.*'s articles.

The volume's greatest defect is that almost all the unsigned articles (almost three hundred articles) are based entirely on local sources, chiefly the public library's reference files and the publications of local historians. This appears to stem from the initial structure of the research that underlies the volume, and it lends a markedly provincial quality to the book despite the evident efforts of the editors to overcome the initial bias. The phrase "little is known" marks innumerable articles, yet as the signed articles demonstrate, and the *D.C.B.* does too, a good deal of the information that is not known could have been found. Even such widely available and valuable sources as legislative journals and the *Monetary Times* go wholly or largely uncited. It is depressing also that, apart from an unspecific reference in Weaver's introduction and a very few citations, invariably in the signed scholarly articles, the whole body of potentially relevant modern secondary historical literature, even that explicitly on Hamilton, might as well not exist. Thus, Michael Katz's work is cited just once and Bryan Palmer's not at all, while, for example, the article on T.C. Keefer ignores H.V. Nelles' outstanding modern edition of *The Philosophy of Railroads and Other Essays*. Thus, this volume

will not lead the Hamiltonians who rely on it to directly pertinent secondary sources, let alone to many relevant primary ones. The reader seeking information on a specific theme can, to a degree, get help from the massive index, though it is, probably unavoidably, entirely nominal. But if he follows up on the almost twenty references to the Bank of Hamilton, for example, he learns at each point only that another individual was at one time or another on a list of founders or directors; nowhere does he get any further information about what was involved in founding and running the bank, who was particularly central to it and how, or what its real role was in Hamilton.

The same point can be made in terms of municipal politics. Virtually all of Hamilton's mayors for the period 1847-75 are here, though one could not find this information from the index or any list within the volume, but a reading of all the articles together leaves one little more able to grasp the dynamics of local politics than before — and certainly no farther ahead than after a reading of Johnston and Campbell's books. The opportunity has not been taken to discuss explicitly what were the issues before City Council (except, in somewhat repetitive terms, the concealment of some of the assessment rolls in 1862) during important mayoralities, nor would a reader have any further idea what a mayor did in Hamilton. If he were reading a Hamilton local history and came upon a mayor's name, then turned to the *D.H.B.* to find out more about his role in the context of city politics, he would nearly always find himself referred back to the same local history and in possession of no more information about the issue than he began with. He would now know something of the ancestry and other activities of the mayor, and that might help (it would save consulting Hamilton Public Library files at least), but he would not find that researchers for the volume had added to the earlier source's material on municipal politics. Thus, unlike the *D.C.B.*, the *D.H.B.* does not seem to have sought to use connected series of articles consciously to discuss specific dimensions of the city's past. This is, it needs to be said, less a criticism of what the book set out to be than a commentary on how scholars who wish to pursue thematic aspects of Hamilton's history are likely to be frustrated if they try to use the *D.H.B.* in exploring topics that specially interest them.

The book largely avoids the most annoying problems of local history, though a few echoes remain of classic local phraseology and preoccupations. The article on Adam Brown, for example, appears to credit him with creating Ontario's late-nineteenth century cheese export industry, while, in an otherwise fine article by T.M. Bailey on J.S. Hogan, one learns that he "might have become a future father of Confederation" (p. 104). A variety of other problems might also be cited. Brian Land is deprived (at least at p. 219) of credit for one of the articles he

wrote. The article on Charles Durand appears to put Baldwin and Lafontaine in power in 1844, while that on Peter Carroll implies that the Bank of Hamilton was founded in the 1850s. Allan MacNab's assumption of the Canadian premiership, correctly dated at 1854 in Don Beer's excellent article on MacNab, is dated 1855 in the next article, on MacNab's daughter Sophia. Despite the book's own evidence, the author of the article on Adam Fergusson thinks the Gore District declined economically in the 1840s, while the author on the article on Henry McKinstry thinks there was a depression extending from 1857 to 1867. J.G. Hodgins was not "deputy minister of education" in 1855 (p. 131). Withal, to the extent that time and funding permitted, the volume has a highly professional quality and remarkably few of these sorts of lapses, which might very well have bedeviled a book produced by so many hands.

In short, this volume represents first class local history and is highly recommended for all those interested in Hamilton's past. The city's local historical community, and particularly the many individuals involved with production of this volume, have much cause for satisfaction in the result of their efforts. One hesitates even so to urge it as a model in urban history and as an approach for other cities to emulate (the prospect of such dictionaries for every city in Canada would doubtless send shivers down the spines of granting agencies), and it is to be hoped that the future volumes envisaged will succeed more completely in transcending the localism that is the present volume's most serious limitation.

Douglas McCalla
Department of History
Trent University

Artibise, Alan F.J., and Stelter, Gilbert A. *Canada's Urban Past: A Bibliography to 1980 and Guide to Canadian Urban Studies*. Vancouver: University of British Columbia Press, 1981. Pp. xxxix, 396. \$42.00 (cloth), \$20.00 (paper).

This substantial and up-to-date bibliography will be a useful addition to any reference collection whose users require information relating to urban studies in Canada. The scope of the work is wide, reflecting the authors' view of urban history as "a field of knowledge in which many disciplines converge." Thus, the work in many different areas of research, from political science to public health, as well as many different genres, from tourist guides to census tracts, is included.

The 7,054 items listed, including bibliographies and many recent theses, together with the archives, special libraries, journals, and other sources described in the

Guide, will undoubtedly lead the searcher to virtually all the material that exists. For example, policy and planning documents published since the 1920s are generally excluded, but bibliographies on relevant policy areas are listed. (The dust-jacket blurb claiming that the bibliography "brings together virtually all of the material that exists in the field of Canadian urban studies" is slightly misleading). The work aims to be complete to 1980, and in fact even includes a few 1981 publications.

The arrangement is similar to that used in Professor Stelter's smaller but still useful 1972 bibliography. A General Section covers Bibliographies and Guides to Sources, General Works, Historiography and Methodology (including selected non-Canadian material). There follow general thematic studies under the headings: Growth and Economic Development (including Transportation); Population; Urban Environment (including Planning); and Municipal Government. Studies on these topics, and others, which refer to specific places, are listed in the geographical section — the major part of the bibliography — arranged by region, province, and city or town, East to West. Most of the references are in English, with a fair representation in the French language — mainly in the Quebec section, as might be expected.

There are Author, Place and Subject indexes. The Place index serves as a finding aid for works dealing with more than one place, and for those listed under "Other Centres" in each province, which do not have their own separate section. The Subject index is a crucial item in a geographically-arranged bibliography of this size, and here, despite the obvious care taken to cover all the subjects, with topical and place subdivisions as needed, one does find some problems. Cross-references, both "see" and "see also," are indeed provided, but as a long-time user of indexes, I feel there could be more; for example, the term "Ethnicity" might not occur to everyone looking for references on minorities or racial problems — neither of which appear; "pollution" is another urban problem which could be listed with references to the headings Water, Sewage, and Public Health; entries under Settlement Patterns could usefully be linked to those under Migration and related terms; the "see also" reference, under Welfare to Public Health, could also mention the heading Child Welfare. Material on "heritage conservation" (a phrase used in the Introduction) is not found under this heading; under Conservation are listed two references, with the direction to "see also" Ecology and Architecture; under Architecture one finds a reference to Preservation, architectural, and it is under this heading that the bulk of the entries on this subject are listed. However, an article entitled "Urban preservation in London" does not appear under any of these headings. Other entries not apparently included in the Subject index include *The Macmillan Book of Canadian Place Names* (Bibliography #10) (while G.A. Armstrong's *The Origin and*