

Scientia Canadensis

Canadian Journal of the History of Science, Technology and Medicine
Revue canadienne d'histoire des sciences, des techniques et de la médecine

Scientia
Canadensis

Enlightened Zeal: The Hudson's Bay Company and Scientific Networks, 1670–1870. By Ted Binnema. Toronto: University of Toronto Press, 2014. 488 p., notes, ill., bibl. ISBN 978-1-44261-47-58, \$37.95

Richard Dunn

Volume 38, Number 2, 2015

URI: <https://id.erudit.org/iderudit/1038355ar>

DOI: <https://doi.org/10.7202/1038355ar>

[See table of contents](#)

Publisher(s)

CSTHA/AHSTC

ISSN

1918-7750 (digital)

[Explore this journal](#)

Cite this review

Dunn, R. (2015). Review of [*Enlightened Zeal: The Hudson's Bay Company and Scientific Networks, 1670–1870.* By Ted Binnema. Toronto: University of Toronto Press, 2014. 488 p., notes, ill., bibl. ISBN 978-1-44261-47-58, \$37.95]. *Scientia Canadensis*, 38(2), 93–94. <https://doi.org/10.7202/1038355ar>

All Rights Reserved © Richard Dunn, 2015

This document is protected by copyright law. Use of the services of Érudit (including reproduction) is subject to its terms and conditions, which can be viewed online.

<https://apropos.erudit.org/en/users/policy-on-use/>

érudit

This article is disseminated and preserved by Érudit.

Érudit is a non-profit inter-university consortium of the Université de Montréal, Université Laval, and the Université du Québec à Montréal. Its mission is to promote and disseminate research.

<https://www.erudit.org/en/>

En somme, l'auteur a effectué une excellente biographie sociale de son personnage pour lequel il a toutefois été clément, sans doute par empathie, par rapport à certaines de ses actions moins avisées comme son conflit d'intérêt potentiel concernant le contrat de construction accordé à son frère par les commissaires de la CECM, son cumul de fonctions et de salaires auprès d'un même employeur et, enfin, sa pension perçue comme ancien enseignant alors qu'il était encore à l'emploi de la CECM.
Christian Dessureault, Université de Montréal

Enlightened Zeal: The Hudson's Bay Company and Scientific Networks, 1670–1870. By Ted Binnema. Toronto: University of Toronto Press, 2014. 488 p., notes, ill., bibl. ISBN 978-1-44261-47-58, \$37.95.

In his introduction to *Enlightened Zeal*, Ted Binnema notes that there has to date been no comprehensive treatment of science undertaken in the context of the chartered monopolies. This broad survey of science in the Hudson's Bay Company (HBC), specifically of the science that made it to outside recipients and the public domain, is an attempt to put that right, and the HBC is a perfect subject, given the extensive surviving archive on which Binnema draws.

Binnema's central argument is that 'the HBC's large contributions to science were made possible by the development of extensive networks that linked metropolitan and elite scientists, company directors, and HBC officers in North America (and to a lesser extent, HBC labourers and aboriginal people) in mutually beneficial and satisfying relationships' (xvi). The narrative identifies three broad periods. In its first century, the HBC made scant contribution to public knowledge and could even be a barrier to the dissemination of information. Minor exceptions came in efforts to locate the Northwest Passage and the work of individuals such as Christopher Middleton. This changed after the company became involved in the scientific activities surrounding the 1769 Transit of Venus. Henceforth, being seen to collaborate in scientific undertakings—exploration, surveying, cartography, and the observational sciences (astronomy, meteorology, natural history and ethnology)—became important to the company and its public image. This might include facilitating travel, collecting and transporting specimens, and allowing or encouraging company officers to participate.

A second turning point came with the merger with

the North West Company in 1821, ending decades of fierce territorial competition. Thereafter, the HBC and its officers productively collaborated and fed into European and American scientific discussions. The company supported Royal Navy explorations into the Arctic and in search of the Northwest Passage, as well as launching its own expeditions, including those of John Rae. It joined the "magnetic crusade," helping Toronto become an important scientific node following the foundation of the Magnetical and Meteorological Observatory. It also supported Paul Kane's attempts to document "western Indians" and the collecting activities of the Smithsonian Institution, which became the foremost repository of scientific knowledge about HBC territories.

Binnema is keen to emphasise throughout that "science is driven by interests" (294), with those of the HBC focusing on corporate image in its attempts to combat ongoing hostility towards monopolies. In this context, scientific practitioners' published praise for the company's support could be more powerful than any lobbying or advertising. Scientific collaboration could, however, be a double-edged sword: come the nineteenth century, the HBC found itself embroiled in the expansionist movements developing in America and Canada.

Enlightenment Zeal has much to say about the history of Canadian science and the emergence of Canadian national identity, and about broader themes too: commercial interest as a driver, and concomitant arguments for sharing or hoarding knowledge; the tension between exploration and science on expeditions purporting to undertake both; the importance of individual (rather than corporate) interest and participation. On this last point, Binnema notes that, "[s]cientific networks were maintained by the self-interest of the many that were involved in their intricate connections, but really flourished when sophisticated and empathetic scientists stirred the scientific enthusiasm of lay collectors" (289). He also notes that HBC territories were generally conducive to science: relatively free of disease, with a climate that was not too problematic for deploying instruments, and which provided an ideal laboratory for low-temperature investigations.

This is self-consciously a big picture narrative, with Binnema citing John Pickstone's *Ways of Knowing* (University of Chicago Press, 2000) in support. With this in mind, I felt that the narrative could more explicitly acknowledge the ways in which scientific practice changed over the period covered. Doing science in the late seventeenth

century was very different from doing it two centuries later, by which time there was such a thing as a professional scientist. Terminology is equally important: one should not really call the military officer Edward Sabine an “eminent geophysicist” (211) or use the term scientist before the mid-nineteenth century. How people described themselves and their practices—what they thought they were doing—is crucial for understanding the big picture.

Nevertheless, *Enlightened Zeal* is well written and enlightening. It will be a valuable source for academics and is comprehensively referenced and indexed, with some supporting images including useful maps. It could certainly serve as a model for thinking about how other chartered monopolies contributed to science. It could also inspire more detailed work on scientific practices within the HBC and its territories. There are clearly fascinating tales still to be told.

Richard Dunn, *Royal Museums Greenwich*

Arts & Science at Toronto A History, 1827-1990.

By Robert Craig Brown. Toronto: University of Toronto Press, 2013. 352 p., notes, bibl. ISBN 978-1-44264-51-34, \$46.50).

The University of Toronto and its constituent elements have been the subject of several historical studies in recent years. The centrepiece is Martin Friedland’s *The University of Toronto: A History*, a splendid comprehensive history that both synthesised existing research and stimulated further research. But works also have appeared on the university’s individual colleges, faculties, and departments, including this reviewer’s history of its engineering faculty, *The Skule Story*, done on conjunction with Friedland’s book. There is no clear explanation for this new work. It has not been funded or promoted by any agent. Perhaps just the absence of histories about such an important public institution has spurred it along, though one suspects the growing number of retired university academics is a factor as well. In any case, here is another contribution.

“Craig” Brown, as he was always known, was among the earliest of the new generation of Canadian historians at the University of Toronto. An American, from western New York, who did his undergraduate degree at the University of Rochester, Brown came to the University of Toronto for graduate studies in the late 1950s and, studying under Donald Creighton, completed his

PhD in 1962 with a dissertation on Canada-US relations. He was appointed to the teaching staff of the History department a few years later, and there he remained, advancing through the ranks and serving in various administrative posts until his retirement. Essentially a liberal humanist, with an inclination for portraying the big picture, Brown is perhaps best known as co-author, with Ramsay Cook, of *Canada 1896-1921: A Nation Transformed*, one of the better, and still quite useful, volumes in the Canadian centenary series, but his history of Robert Borden is also well regarded, and the *Illustrated History of Canada*, which he edited, remains a respected, and good-selling, popular history.

It is hard to say exactly what this book is about. At first glance one might call it a history of the university’s Faculty of Arts and Science, but on second glance one will see that the word “faculty” is absent from the title, probably because from 1853 to 1901 there was no Faculty, per se, as the teaching staff all belonged to individual colleges. So the book is actually about “Arts and Science” in the generic sense, rather than as a formal institution—although this leads to confusion since much of it is in fact about the Faculty as an institution. Also problematic in definitional terms is that since teaching and research in “arts and science” are the university’s fundamental purpose the history of those two words is essentially the history of the university. And sure enough for maybe its first two-thirds the book is little more than a retelling of the standard, chronological narrative of the University of Toronto’s history—founded as King’s College, reconstituted as University College, amalgamated with the religious colleges, reconstituted again with professional faculties, and on into the world wars, the influx of veterans, and the great postwar expansion. One reads about the 1890 fire, the 1911 overlooking of British historian Lewis Namier, the 1930s struggles with Frank Underhill, and many other such events, most of which are well covered in Friedland’s history—which is often cited as a source.

Yet this lack of originality is not a significant shortcoming, at least not to this reader. Brown writes clearly and insightfully, often connecting events at the university with events in the world around it, and in doing so tells the story in an engaging, readable manner. By no means is the book entirely devoid of original observations or comments; his frequent inclusion of professors’ salaries and student fees is intriguing, as is his critical portrayal of physicist J.C. McLennan in