

Renaissance and Reformation
Renaissance et Réforme



Burn, David J., Grantley R. McDonald, Joseph Verheyden, and Peter De Mey, eds. Music and Theology in the European Reformations

Michael O'Connor

Volume 43, Number 1, Winter 2020

URI: <https://id.erudit.org/iderudit/1070190ar>

DOI: <https://doi.org/10.33137/rr.v43i1.34106>

[See table of contents](#)

Publisher(s)

Iter Press

ISSN

0034-429X (print)

2293-7374 (digital)

[Explore this journal](#)

Cite this review

O'Connor, M. (2020). Review of [Burn, David J., Grantley R. McDonald, Joseph Verheyden, and Peter De Mey, eds. Music and Theology in the European Reformations]. *Renaissance and Reformation / Renaissance et Réforme*, 43(1), 217–219. <https://doi.org/10.33137/rr.v43i1.34106>

© All Rights Reserved Canadian Society for Renaissance Studies / Société canadienne d'études de la Renaissance; Pacific Northwest Renaissance Society; Toronto Renaissance and Reformation Colloquium; Victoria University Centre for Renaissance and Reformation Studies, 2020

This document is protected by copyright law. Use of the services of Érudit (including reproduction) is subject to its terms and conditions, which can be viewed online.

<https://apropos.erudit.org/en/users/policy-on-use/>

érudit

This article is disseminated and preserved by Érudit.

Érudit is a non-profit inter-university consortium of the Université de Montréal, Université Laval, and the Université du Québec à Montréal. Its mission is to promote and disseminate research.

<https://www.erudit.org/en/>

lens that deemed their publications problematic, sexualized, and scandalous. O'Hara and Lingo carefully point out the relevance of a midwifery text written by a woman who was aware of and anticipated the upcoming battle over the management of childbirth. They unfold and unravel the hierarchies (historical, political, and professional) that informed Bourgeois's place at the French court and the noble patronage tradition that freed her to write a text which, in three volumes, served to address midwifery conduct, training, and ethics, in order to produce an erudite manual that discussed female anatomy, theories of conception, reproductive processes, childbirth management, associated illnesses, and post-partum care for both mother and child, along with several recipes for remedies and treatments. Of particular note in this edition is the extensive glossary of medical terminology used during the early modern period that facilitates access to Bourgeois's text and to the medical milieu within which her text operated. O'Hara and Lingo's thoughtful and well-researched edition of Louise Bourgeois's *Observations diverses* provides access to further research on early modern midwifery and the gendered aspects of women's contributions to midwifery, medicine, and the history of science.

AIDA PATIENT

Mount Royal University

Burn, David J., Grantley R. McDonald, Joseph Verheyden, and Peter De Mey, eds.

Music and Theology in the European Reformations.

Turnhout: Brepols, 2019. Pp. 500 + 33 b/w ill., 31 b/w tables, 10 music examples. ISBN 978-2-503-58226-9 (paperback) €100.

This volume brings together the work of twenty scholars with affiliations in Europe, North America, and Australia. The premise of the book is that periods marked by realignment and change in doctrine are also marked by a reassessment of doctrine's relationship to music—the European Reformations (plural) being one of “the most crucial such junctures” (25). All those who took on the mantle of reformer had to address matters of music—either positively or sceptically—in the service of worship, education, evangelization, and discipline; “no reformer considered music inconsequential” (58). At the same

time, the focus on music is not exclusive; theology is as much the subject of the fascinating essays that make up this volume, and I recommend it not only to scholars of music but to all readers of this journal.

While the book's centre of gravity is the sixteenth and seventeenth centuries, there are introductory essays on the late medieval legacy of Wycliffe, Hus, and Savonarola (Trocmé-Latter), and a final essay that looks at historiographical questions (Malisse). The collection is interdisciplinary, drawing on philosophical, theological, liturgical, and prophetic sources (the sibylline oracles); the methods of biblical exegesis and musicological analysis and interpretation; and the study of archives, manuscripts, books, and publishing practices.

There are at least a couple of recurring thematic threads in the book. First, differences over music do not map easily onto denominational differences. For example, a strong concern with textual intelligibility in music for worship is not confined to any one group—we find it in Reformed and Tridentine sources, German cities, and Italian nunneries. With their use of organs and Latin polyphonic motets, Lutherans were often accused of backsliding, of being not-so-crypto papists. The Lutheran embrace of the organ is articulated in theology and in stone: in the wake of Luther's high theology of music as "next to the Word of God," organs were established at the front of churches in close partnership with the pulpit (Davies). Meanwhile, there were loud voices on the Catholic side aligning with Protestant calls for the prohibition of liturgical polyphony.

Second, music is difficult to police. Even if it not strictly autonomous, it has a potency that is undeniable but elusive. There is no shortage of exhortation from on high about appropriate music for worship, but it is seldom matched by enforceable regulations. Casuistic sources find it much easier to talk about texts than music (Bisaro). Composers like Byrd, Janequin (Dobbins), and Leonhard (Burn and McDonald) were able to hold down positions with ecclesiastical affiliations that did not reflect their deepest beliefs, yet these beliefs could be expressed in subtle and subversive ways through their musical compositions. Publishers in religiously diverse regions were able to format publications so that they would appeal to all sides, serving a "supraconfessional market" (Schmidt, 183).

Echoing both themes is a fascinating chapter by Alanna Ropchok Tierno on the endurance of Josquin's *Missa Pange Lingua* among Lutheran communities. Josquin (d. 1521) based the mass on the melody of a hymn from the Office of Corpus Christi where it sets Aquinas's words in honour of the Eucharist. The

melody is clearly audible throughout and would easily have called to mind, in those who knew them, festive processions and solemn Eucharistic devotions. Tierno shows how the impact of this melody was gradually altered by means of a German language version of the text, now free of any mention of transubstantiation; and the function of the *Missa* itself was altered through incorporation into official Lutheran worship services. Thus, a piece of music that did not look promising at all from the point of view of Reformation theological controversy (even if composed by Luther's favourite composer) could yet be retained and reimagined—as a kind of musical spoil of the Egyptians.

Alongside the concern for music used in divine praise (whether in church or at home), a couple of chapters present developments in the theory of music. Hyun-Ah Kim's chapter on *musica humana* shows how the tradition of musical contemplation flowing from Boethius could become a rich spiritual discipline in the Swiss Reformation. Inga Mai Groote demonstrates the afterlife of Melancthon's theorizing on the affective properties of music in the work of theologian and pedagogue David Chytraeus (1530–1600).

The book is handsomely produced and comes with a generous supply of images—usually pages from manuscripts or printed books—and tables. Musical examples are fewer and well introduced and explained. It is regrettable that a book as rich in data as this should have no index; admittedly, some readers, or their institutions (mine not among them), may choose to invest in the ebook, which will make tracking of names and places easier.

MICHAEL O'CONNOR

St. Michael's College, University of Toronto

Chesney Zegura, Elizabeth.

Marguerite de Navarre's Shifting Gaze: Perspectives on Gender, Class, and Politics in the Heptaméron.

London: Routledge, Taylor & Francis Group, 2017. viii, 276 p. ISBN 978-1-4724-8730-8 (relié) 124 \$.

Au cours des cinquante dernières années, plusieurs monographies ont été consacrées à l'œuvre narrative de Marguerite de Navarre. Sur l'*Heptaméron*, en particulier, ces recherches remontent aux ouvrages bien connus de Nicole