

# Canadian University Music Review

## Revue de musique des universités canadiennes

Canadian University Music Review

Linda Siegel. *Music in German Romantic Literature: A Collection of Essays, Reviews and Stories*. Novato, California: Elra Publications, 1983, xii, 287 pp.

Linwood DeLong

Number 6, 1985

URI: <https://id.erudit.org/iderudit/1014078ar>

DOI: <https://doi.org/10.7202/1014078ar>

[See table of contents](#)

### Publisher(s)

Canadian University Music Society / Société de musique des universités canadiennes

### ISSN

0710-0353 (print)

2291-2436 (digital)

[Explore this journal](#)

### Cite this review

DeLong, L. (1985). Review of [Linda Siegel. *Music in German Romantic Literature: A Collection of Essays, Reviews and Stories*. Novato, California: Elra Publications, 1983, xii, 287 pp.] *Canadian University Music Review / Revue de musique des universités canadiennes*, (6), 345–347.  
<https://doi.org/10.7202/1014078ar>

average of twenty-two each day, dealing with every conceivable aspect of the opera business.

Rosselli sees the decline of the impresario as stemming from two principal causes: (1) the gradual democratization of audiences in the years approaching 1870, and (2) the gradual passing of authority to publishers and, to a lesser degree, composers. By the end of the century, for example, opera in Milan was dominated not by an impresario but by Giulio Ricordi (publisher of both Verdi and Puccini), who controlled not only casting but all other phases of opera production. Clearly a new day had dawned, one in which the by now old-fashioned impresario was obsolete. Moreover, opera was by this time largely a repertory affair, with seasons increasingly devoted to the performance of a small number of established works, a situation that still obtains today. The number of new operas produced at Naples' Teatro San Carlo reached a high of thirty-eight in the 1831-40 decade, dropping to one or two per year during the 1860s. The impresarios did not survive the changes of these decades and by the end of the century were largely extinct. During their time, however, they had a powerful impact upon the way in which opera was produced and even composed, and their story clearly deserves to be told. Urbane, literate, witty, and scholarly without being in the least bit pedantic, Rosselli's book tells the story of the impresarios, and in doing so makes a valuable contribution to the history of the genre.

Kenneth DeLong

LINDA SIEGEL. *Music in German Romantic Literature: A Collection of Essays, Reviews and Stories*. Novato, California: Elra Publications, 1983, xii, 287 pp.

With her book, *Music in German Romantic Literature: A Collection of Essays, Reviews and Stories*, Linda Siegel offers an interesting, well-written, carefully edited, but somewhat puzzling contribution to the subject of the interrelationship between music and literature during the period of German Romanticism.

The title of any book, but especially the title of an interdisciplinary study such as this one, should indicate quite clearly what the reader can expect to find. Given the book's title, this reviewer was somewhat surprised by the choice of texts. Although some of the well-known Romantics, Tieck, Arnim, Kleist, Eichendorff, and Körner, are represented, there are also almost thirty pages devoted to Ludwig Börne, a name which is not associated with German Romanticism either in the standard histories or in annual bibliographies of German literature. E.T.A. Hoffmann, author of one of the most well-known German Romantic texts dealing with music, is completely absent. Robert Schumann, another name not usually associated with German literature,

though certainly with German Romantic music, is the last name on the table of contents page.

The preface and introductory chapters provide an explanation for this outwardly slightly curious choice of texts, but also reveal one of the problematic aspects of this study. Because of the attention that is normally given to writers such as Wackenroder, Hoffmann, Jean Paul Richter, and to a lesser extent, Novalis, Brentano, and Heine, Linda Siegel has chosen to focus on "equally important participants in this literary-musical *Gesellschaft* [who] are less well-known for their use of music in literature" (p. xi). The underlying reason for focusing on these unfamiliar texts is not to modify the prevailing coverage of music in German literary criticism, but rather to show that "German Romantic literature is one of the prime musicological sources for the study of German Romantic music" and that "the literary efforts of the German Romantic authors played a most important role in shaping the musical aesthetics of the German Romantic composers" (p. xi). Thus the stated purpose of this book is not to study the role of music in German Romantic literature but to study the role of German literature in German Romantic music.

This reviewer found that something of a tension exists in the book as a whole between a musicological and a literary orientation. The bibliography seems weighted in favour of German Romantic literature and offers only a few references to discussions of German Romantic music or romanticism in music. The four main introductory chapters have a stronger musicological focus. The first provides biographical information on German Romantic writers, showing which ones received musical training or were acquainted with musicians of the period. The second describes the reform in Protestant church music that was launched by Johann Georg Hamann and Gottfried Herder and that culminated in the Caecilian Movement. The third chapter describes the musical genres that received the greatest prominence in the writings of the German Romantics and offers insights into the role of German Romantic writers as musical critics. The fourth chapter analyzes the manner in which German Romantic writers and composers sought to translate the world of nature into musical tones.

Although Siegel has brought together considerable material from both musicology and literary criticism, the proof that the musical aesthetics of German Romantic writers strongly influenced German Romantic composers is often illusive. Statements such as "Guided by the theories of Wackenroder, Hoffmann in his *Alte und Neue Kirchenmusik* . . . offered a solution that was palatable to many German Romantics" (p. 29) or "Catholic church musicians soon agreed with Herder that the solution to the problem of sacred music was to adopt the style of the old Italian church music" (p. 27) are not substantiated by any supporting quotes or documentation. In the chapter entitled "Opera, Singing and Song" Siegel suggests a parallel between the revolt by Bodmer, Breitinger, and Lessing against the predominance of French theater in Germany and the demise of

the French influence on German opera in the Romantic era. Again, she is not able to document this. In particular she is not able to cite any statements by Wagner, the prime mover in developing a truly German form of opera, that acknowledge a debt of any kind to the criticism by German Romantic writers of the prevailing style of opera in the early nineteenth century. Instead one must accept Siegel's statement — "I see no difference between Wagner's supposedly unusual attention to the requirements of good theater and that of the German Romantic writers" (p. 52) — as it stands. It is regrettable that Siegel offers no clear definition of what she means by German Romantic music, whether it means music written during a certain time period or music embodying certain characteristics.

The texts that follow the introductory essays have been very well translated and read very easily in their English form. For the most part, they have been well annotated and well chosen. Tieck's "Musical Sorrows and Joys" offers a wealth of background material on his knowledge of music and music history. The opening paragraphs of Börne's essay on Henriette Sontag show him to be a true Romantic. The other musical critiques of his that are presented here are frequently brief remarks about performances by specific artists and do not reveal much about Börne's overall musical aesthetics. Nor do these texts always buttress the assertions that Siegel makes about the manner in which composers such as Paer, Martin, and Weigl were received by German Romantic composers. The same observation applies to the opera critiques of Kleist. Kleist's "Holy Cecilia or the Power of Music" on the other hand is entirely suitable for Siegel's anthology and takes on new meaning in the light of her discussion of the Caecilian Movement.

Given Siegel's musicological orientation it is regrettable that she has not chosen more excerpts from the writings of German composers. The passages by Schumann certainly document his belief in the interrelationship between music and literature, but they do not include references to any German Romantic writers.

In summary it is debatable whether Siegel really shows that German Romantic music really began to develop "much earlier than is customarily thought" (p. xi) and whether the composers she cites in this connection are shown by her evidence to be Romantics. Siegel has, however, produced a thought-provoking, highly readable collection of original scholarly essays and literary texts that illustrate the rich intermingling of music and literature during the period of German Romanticism. Students of German literature, who may prefer to read the primary texts in the original, will benefit from the musicological research that Siegel has done. English-speaking musicologists who are acquainted with only the standard texts of German Romantic literature will find these translations worthy of their attention and will benefit from Siegel's solid grounding in German literary criticism.